

# German-English Tales Study

— Page 352 - 359 —

April 7th

Attendees: Robin, Bobbie, Frieda, Ekant, Vanya, Kirk +

Meeting Transcript

Speaker 3: So I don't remember where in the beginning of this chapter was marble tablet mentioned

Speaker 6: In the German version? In any version. Ah, okay.

Speaker 5: I think so, but I'm not sure

Speaker 3: I mean I remember Ashyada Shimaj, he didn't teach, he didn't write things, but then all of a sudden this tablet comes up with engravings on it. In the German, it looks to me like he has inscribed or someone has inscribed. And then my thought about it going to the other towns was that other people added their Intentions or impressions So can you word search that Robin?

Speaker 1: Uh what do you want me to search for? Marble tablet?

Speaker 3: Yeah, please.

Speaker 6: Are you saying you think it came up before the reading today, Bobby?

Speaker 3: I I think I hadn't heard it in in any of the readings before today.

Speaker 6: Well, I think it was the just appearing today too. Okay. And uh there was something in later chapters About relics that were found that were perhaps made of marble. I can't quite place them as you mention it. But it wasn't these marble tablets.

Speaker 1: Marble tablets is mentioned on page three forty-nine.

Speaker 3: Okay, thank you. So in the previous chapter.

Speaker 1: Oh it is? Well, previous reading.

Speaker 3: Yeah. Oh yeah. Well In chapter twenty five.

Speaker 5: Again I feel reminded of um last time we had this um three times forty days, I think, where I can found something that it's like where where was a um uh connection to Moses and the marble table is a little bit the same association which comes to my mind with the Ten Commandments.

Speaker 3: Yeah, I can see that.

Speaker 5: Yeah, that makes sense

Speaker 4: Yeah, sometimes it's a little bit difficult to keep the connection when we have a week in in between is for me the same. But actually he introduces it the chapter before and now he explains more in detail what it's is meant. Right. So I g I guess.

Speaker 6: Another thing I got confused on in that manner was on page 360, he says, thus

ended the Ligomanism. And he says, so my boy, when, as I have already told you early in my last descent in person, and I was thinking, is it that far along in his descents? Is this his sixth descent that he starts to investigate uh archaeologists? Not until his last descent. I'm I'm just I'm just I just got confused about that and I was looking about the Elzebub's fifth flight Earth, which I guess we've read already.

Speaker 5: Yeah.

Speaker 6: They go so fast.

Speaker 5: So well I think so that was the one where he comes down to um Oh, nach Babel, oder? War das nicht da? Babylon, yes.

Speaker 6: And the sixth life is when he goes to Europe, basically, right?

Speaker 1: Yeah, it it the sixth flight is it traces Gurdjieff's steps. So on the sixth flight, Beelzebub and Gurdjieff find are very similar.

Speaker 6: Right. So that reference to my last, he does his investigations during my last ascent. Is he referring us to his sixth or his fifth, do you suppose?

Speaker 1: I think the fifth, isn't it?

Speaker 6: It's I'm not four feeling If it matters, but it seems like it would matter.

Speaker 1: He places Ashia Tashimash in the kind of Babylonian era without actually saying it was the Babylonian era, but it's prior to the um include y prior to the appearance of Lencho Hansen and all of that um let's say uh negative impact on the works of Ashyatashima.

Speaker 6: So yeah, then I was thinking, so he's he had to be there. Well I mean he he obviously did not meet Ashiada Shimashi in purpose or Lintro Hampson. And uh they were quite a bit earlier than his, well, they weren't earlier than his descents. They just weren't in his earlier descents. He did not come across them in his earlier descents.

Speaker 1: it is um surrounds the whole of the definition of art and the creation of legominisms, the whole kind of um uh activity surrounding that.

Speaker 6: Uh well and that's another thing, uh his use of the term legominets. I had to go back and read the whole legominess of my vice biological max. to uh understand a little bit what we're uh reading today. And the uh it's sort of like, well that's not what I thought legamanism was. What uh Ashyadash Yimash said That's uh that's almost like just a declaration of uh how he was called to duty, if you will, called to duty and uh fulfilled that commitment to the higher. If that makes any sense. I'm not speaking very clearly

Speaker 1: Well the the legomanism, the idea of a legomanism is just any knowledge passed down.

Speaker 6: Okay.

Speaker 1: So it's so if uh Ashyata Shimash wants to tell you his life story and that gets put on, let's say, a marble tablet that can be read by future generations. It's a legominism, whether it interests you or not is a different question.

Speaker 6: Yeah, and I and I guess I was always associating it with the idea of uh the arts that are explained in those chapters uh in the in the uh culton um groups. that develop those arts. I'm getting way ahead of us here though. I couldn't do

Speaker 1: Yeah, you're getting way ahead. You you're you're you're leaving the whole group behind, you're going so fast.

Speaker 6: Well No, and the thing is I'm going so fast you don't know if I'm telling the truth or not. I'm lying. I'm voice acrying.

Speaker 3: But you're doing it in English.

Speaker 6: I'll bet you Frida still knows what I'm saying and does not approve.

Speaker 7: Sorry, I didn't follow everything. I was preoccupied with what Akon put in the chat.

Speaker 3: Oh, I didn't even notice. Let's see

Speaker 4: Yeah, I just uh put about the sixty cents.

Speaker 3: And I think he was talking about the six descent when he said my last descent. Okay I mean that's my impression.

Speaker 4: Cannot be because we are now in the fifth. Oh Ashyata Shimash is the fifth.

Speaker 1: Yeah, it would be difficult for him to talk about the sixty cent during the fifth.

Speaker 3: Although they're flying around or whatever, and uh He's giving him the look at what had happened to him during these prior descents. So I mean when he says my last ascent, I I take it for what it was.

Speaker 4: Yeah, it's the question if if if if last means the sixth, the last of all, or the last from n where the story is in. And I understand it more that we are now in in the story around the fifth descent. And then he m he maybe he refers to the fifth Yeah, I think he what in the sense what I told you la lately so about my So in this sense I understand I understood it.

Speaker 5: The German version would even would also um um underline that because there it said does the letzte, which is the last If it would be diezte, um which would the sixth, it would be written w in capital letters and not in small letters. Okay. So that that uh the German version would more refer to the to the fifth.

Speaker 3: The last we were talking about. Like Sandy said, does it make a difference? Yeah. So many times when he um quotes tomorrow in the German is he quoting morning Morgen, yes.

Speaker 5: Morgen uh is also you also say it in in German, morgen means tomorrow. Okay.

Speaker 6: I never thought of that, Barbara.

Speaker 4: Yeah, der Morgen, so a noun. Der morgen means the first part of the day. Before uh midday and mor ist, ein Adjektiv?

Speaker 7: Nee, Adverb.

Speaker 5: Yeah, and so it's basically confusing because he's writing it in cap with a capital letter which would mean mourning, but from the context it it basically can't mean mourning. Okay. It means Tomorrow.

Speaker 4: Yeah he m writes many things in capital letters in this In this yes.

Speaker 5: Which is confusing, yes, yes, yes.

Speaker 4: Indicates how important it is.

Speaker 5: He also writes when he's um he's saying his or A sein und seine he writes in in capital letters. Normally he only writes it in capital letters when he's talking about God and not about a person.

Speaker 6: So we're looking at Zine uh tell us for an example is I'm thinking sign impulse, sign essence something. Yeah, thank you.

Speaker 3: Were you looking, Sammy?

Speaker 6: I wasn't. I was uh asking where are we looking?

Speaker 5: I thought I thought you you found it.

Speaker 6: I didn't find one. I was uh really relying again on my wife's A-pring memory.

Speaker 5: Wait.

Speaker 6: He where was it? You can't trust me one minute.

Speaker 4: Morgan is on page three six two.

Speaker 5: Yeah. But where it was with the Oh, I don't find one.

Speaker 6: Stein's existence is also on three six two. The gewöhnlichen Sein's existence. Yeah.

Speaker 5: Yeah, but that he's always doing seins existence. It's uh basically he's putting it as a as a noun together. But for example, on page 364, he has this als dieses große und seiner Vernunft nach fast unvergleichliche heilige Individuum. Which is when the great and by his reason, he's doing it in English too. He's writing his reason with a capital letter. And seiner Vernunft and seiner would be with a small letter normally.

Speaker 7: But I just thought because he explains it that it's a very, very sacred individuum.

Speaker 5: So I thought that's just why That it's uh uh individuum higher than normal.

Speaker 6: Almost incomparable.

Speaker 5: Yeah.

Speaker 4: Yeah, he was the only one who succeeded somehow. He taught at the beginning that all the other others did not really succeed and he f at least for quite a time period he succeeded.

Speaker 6: Well, i you mentioned uh seiner uh vernunft nach fast und vergleichlich

geheilige individuuum. Uh and it's like uh that's one thing I really noticed was uh he gets more he gets a longer string of titles, holy titles. than even the absolute does in this chapter, don't you think?

Speaker 5: Yes.

Speaker 6: One other place. Phew

Speaker 5: Yeah, that's true. But also the absolute gets quite a long title in this one. Which which we don't have so long. When he prays it in the starting, it's quite quite long.

Speaker 6: And I told you last week I never pay attention to those titles, right? And I've got to start doing that. Especially I think comparing the German to the English versions of those titles.

Speaker 4: To me the the name of Ashyatashirmash sounds somehow strange. Is there any earlier research on how the name appears and Yeah I mean I read it the first when I read it the first time I was confused. I thought what a strange name somehow.

Speaker 3: Something like light from the sun or

Speaker 2: So one thing that um I I have thought uh speculated on in the past, and I don't know how legitimate this is, is uh Ashyada Shiamash. um I tend to associate with uh Zarathustra uh to some extent and one of the uh one of the important words in um In in Zoroastrianism is Asha, A-S-H-A, which means something like uh cosm cosmic harmony, truth, um justice, uh, you know, it's w one of these abstract kind of concepts, kind of like you know, Sanatan Dharma or the Tao or something like that, but this idea of Asha. And so it might just be me, but whenever I see Ashiata Shiamash, I see those letters in in that Ashiyata. And so it makes me kind of think of of that, you know. Um ray of creation, that's the other thing I should admit. I do whatever I read about a Shah, it like makes me think of like this idea of the Ray of Creation, which is Obviously uh Gurdjeff is interested in.

Speaker 6: Well, I always thought it sounded uh Arabic, not that I really know what Arabic sounds sounds like but that would certainly be in the in the neighborhood of uh the Zoroastrians. So uh yeah I I I can I can buy into that one Paul

Speaker 2: So could I uh do you mind if I throw out another thought that I have, another impression? Um My my my questioning this time going through this is uh is all about faith faith, love and hope. Um and the appearance of that in here. And um I was thinking about how I think Vodya said that the the the the the the tablets you know the tablet part makes you makes us think of Moses. Then the faith, hope, love part makes me think of of Jesus. That's like uh an important part out of the gospels, the three uh theological, I think, theological uh virtues. And it's it it it almost seems like there's I mean the And this whole chapter it's really highlighting on that. Everything, you know, it seems like there's a lot leading up to this faith, hope, and love. And then he breaks it down into this, you know. F faith of consciousness and everything. It's really um there's something really important with these three words. And that happens in the gospels too. You know, Jesus is like these three, you know, that I I can't repeat that line from memory, but there's a big emphasis these three. And it's like saying with that, this is like the essence of this whole teaching can

be like found and decoded. out of these three words. And then I have a question out. This is a question I have about the German to English version of it. Glauba Which I in my mind I had thought of that as that's German for belief, belief. Um Can wait, but is in German is there is there a slight can it also mean faith? Because in English, faith is different than belief. There's like different words that you would use to say and make a subtle distinction. So Um, so I have a question about that for all the German people on here.

Speaker 5: Yeah. Glaube means both it means faith. and believe and you use ich glaube, I believe, like a verb, but you say I have faith. Ich habe ich ja.

Speaker 2: Mhm. Okay, that makes sense, ja.

Speaker 5: I don't know, Frida, maybe some other.

Speaker 2: Would you know that by reading this though? Like by reading the way it's put in here? Would you know by the context you'd say, okay, there it's

Speaker 5: It's definitely faith.

Speaker 2: The spiritual side of it, yeah. Okay.

Speaker 5: Yeah. Yeah.

Speaker 2: Thank you.

Speaker 6: Yep, but I can also I was just gonna say thank you, Paul, because I was not making a distinction between faith and belief till you mentioned it. And that's yeah, that's like really. I'm sorry, Vanya.

Speaker 5: No, it's yeah, and I last time we were also it started already when we read the Legomanism with faith, love and hope. And I was looking up in the Bible it comes from Korintherbrief where we have Hohe Lied. What is that in English? The Song of Songs of Love. I looked that up again and it's very beautiful. I forgot about it and It's nice. It's really a very, very nice part in the Bible. I will look it out I will look for it and put it in the chat.

Speaker 2: So in the in the English like King James and most most English Bibles that faith hope love part has been ch uh changed to faith hope. Charity. Right. And and I and I believe some people say that at the medieval times or whenever that charity used to mean Like a higher love, right? It's as it and in the Greek it's agape. It's Greek, so it definitely the original meaning of it is a higher love. No, not love of brother, not love of of you know um you know husband and wife but love of higher God something, you know, higher uh divinity But in the English, it's been the the meaning of charity is just come to mean give give money to poor people um or else you're an asshole, you know. So it's like taking on a a new meaning, I think, in in uh in uh in English. So I'm curious, in German is faith, hope, love in in German Bibles, has there been that sort of migration of of of love. Is it LIBA is it LIBA or is it has there been any change in that in the Bible in German.

Speaker 5: I don't know if anyone would even know, but I I don't think so. It has changed but I I'm I never heard that that it was changed to something else.

Speaker 1: Well the the English The English is particularly poor in having meanings for the word love. It uses one word. It didn't have any alternative. Charity in some way or other, I think, was pulled out of Latin. in order that it would b it they could have a word. You know, so the it it may well be that the i the the German language was just richer in being able to express these concepts and The Paul English people. English people don't like much anyway. So using the word love was for them a very unfamiliar experience, probably.

Speaker 6: Well, I always think of it in fact, yeah, uh it's it's sort of like the history of uh the writing of Bibles They're not always the same. First the translations from the Greek to the Latin and then the Latin to uh the European languages in it's like it King James was not quite the first English version, but almost, and that's where you see charity, and that's almost like that's a medieval term. or love almost or just out of the medieval age. And I don't know what the German would have been, if that's under Martin Luther or uh uh in and the Lutherans or if they were still using the Latin um version well they would have been in the Catholic services, so I don't know if that helps or not, but I th I think most modern translations use the word love now. I like uh if if we're talking about, say, Corinthians twelve, um uh where where we hear those three terms quite a bit and uh the in the discussion of uh what's the nature of love. Um They they they do say love. They don't say charity anymore. You don't hear charity in a modern Christian service that I know of, and unless maybe you're way down south, Bobby.

Speaker 1: So the the the reason for this was that something happened in the UK to move the language a little bit. And one of the things that had happened was that Christianity was being interpreted as a kind of socialistic way of life.

Speaker 2: Mm.

Speaker 1: And that's why the word charity was picked and moved in that direction. So that, you know, your your love for your fellow man is just kind of being charitable to them, you know They can't, you know, they don't have the energy to mow their lawn, so you get up and mow their lawn for them or something like that. That's just charitable behavior. Um It was a kind of um devaluation of the idea of love, you know. It was um it and in and you can see that this happened in a lot of places anyway. Because, you know, the original communism was just an attempt to apply Christianity and remove the word God. I mean that's what the original intent was. We don't want any, you know, guy would appear in the sky behind this. But you know, we think love's pr kind of a nice thing, uh human beings should love each other. Uh and that's just bent the language a lot. Uh and it's damaged English very considerably, I think. I don't know about America. America's different because the Americans are great believers You know, in in the sense, not all Americans of course, but in the sense that the majority of American people are not atheistic. They believe in something or other. Whereas the majority of British people are atheistic. They don't believe in anything. But that's because we've got a state religion, maybe, and America doesn't have such a thing I don't know. I don't know why it is that way, but it is.

Speaker 6: the nature of belief in this in these passages which are pretty uh evocative. I'm looking for what page it's on My pages are not in order, so I never find anything

Speaker 4: Yeah, in German with love is almost the same. Yeah. There is a a word which is which is clu I think it's could be the translation for charity which is Nächsten Liebe. So it's a combination of combination of the next, then the next, or the closest. Nächsten Liebe.

Speaker 6: Nächsten Liebe.

Speaker 4: Nächsten Liebe. It means the love of of the neighbor or the or someone who is near to you. So but this word is very clearly used just in the Christian context. Very clearly. If you just h hear this word, you know it's about uh Christianity and and Jesus somehow. So But the word love it's used for almost everything, yeah. When someone starts to Be a little bit engaged with himself and to work on himself or whatever, and then there is a certain realization in What uh strange way we all use usually in in in ordinary life we use the word love and I remember myself twenty years before when I started my spiritual path I could say I became very careful not to use this word any uh anymore because I realized I don't know really what it means Yeah and it just came after a while that I started to use it again because it expresses something. Yeah and in this sense it's I think it's similar to what Robin was uh saying about English. People used to use this word for everything. I love sport, I love uh this kind of yogurt or I love uh whatever. Yeah. I love eating, I love watching television, so it's really used in in this in this sense. But in the Bible is still Liebe. There is a certain recognition that it is a very s strong notion and a deep thing, just to complete this. And I also agree with Sandy to go on with these descriptions, which is quite uh strange.

Speaker 7: Yes, no. I have a question about um this uh yes, inscriptions. Um uh the first line or uh the three first lines um consciousness or in German bewusstsein. uh uh I'm not quite sure what is meant with that because uh feeling and body uh are the other are the two centers. So is consciousness meant to be just the intellectual center Or is it meant like consciousness, which we don't have?

Speaker 6: Oh, you're saying, Frida, you don't have uh one form of consciousness? In German that there is in English?

Speaker 7: No, I mean that um I don't when he speaks of the three centers any other time, I don't think he uses consciousness, does he? Intellect intellect. He uses intellect or intellectual center. And consciousness, um, I think, was rather used for for th for the consciousness which we which contemporary beings don't have anymore or can't uh or m must develop through years of work. So I am confused what is meant now here? If if it's meant because the other two are clearly the other two centers, the emotional center and the uh moving center or the body center. So is consciousness the mind, the intellectual center, or is it this greater concept? Yes.

Speaker 6: But to make it even more confusing, I have always tended to conflate conflate consciousness and conscience. And when we're reading through it here, uh, you know, it's hard to keep those two How do they relate to each other? So go ahead. I didn't mean to

interrupt, but I wanted to throw that in the back.

Speaker 4: We also have a difficulty Because uh the English uh words consciousness and awareness, yeah, we have almost just one word, we have just bewusst sein for them. So we have not this uh this distinction even if we also know that everyone uses these words also for different things but we have not really There are words we could also use for awareness, uh, but uh not in the sense of co of consciousness. So Yeah, it's it's what you say, Sandy. There is a certain problem with s n this distinguishing s uh things.

Speaker 1: I th I think it's probably a good idea not to try and put this on the centers, because the centers are just functions anyway. I think he's talking about three different levels. The original definition of the word conscious From In Search of the Miraculous, so it's the definition, let's say, that Gurdjec gave at the beginning, is to know everything all at once. And the original meaning of conscience is to feel everything all at once. So consciousness and conscience are attributes of something that has unity. And that's the defining point, I think, with those words is that they referred to a unity. Now it can happen. that in let's say for a period of time, maybe even a small period of time, you achieve a unity, but you can't retain it. So there's moments in your life when you self-remember, truly self-remember and have a very vivid view of the world as it is, but they're fleeting. And those you would describe as conscious. But if you actually, if you actually had from uh a perspective of being, if you actually had for a long period of time a consciousness, that would indicate that you had an ability to maintain a unity. And the idea of conscience is the same, except it's feeling everything at once. So, you know, and our normal emotional life consists in one way or another of us having a feeling about one thing. Um, let's say somebody And that we know we we meet them on Monday and we like them because they're doing something that in one way or another is, I don't know, fits in with what we're doing. But the the Next day they turn up and they're disagreeing with you about something, so now you dislike them. Well, you haven't got any um conscience in your behavior because you can't like and dislike the same person. You know, you are in, if you like, a contradiction. But the contradiction is hidden from you by buffers and by time. But it's true, either you like the individual, you don't like the individual, um, or you have some kind of um Let let's say if you had a unity there would be some kind of constant attitude towards that individual. But you don't have unity and therefore you can't have the con uh the um uh attitude that is um uh fix. Oh determined is probably a better word than fixed

Speaker 4: Yeah, it even happens in in in in in one in one talk. It's not one day or the other. It's you sp I I often obs observe that the feeling in a in an exchange with someone it's really up and down. So if there is some moments where there is a certain connection, then it uh then the opposite again But I I can follow everything you say, but it's still it I I have also the same uh uh um disturbance like like like like Frida expresses. Yeah. If if Because then we would we could say if he n uses consciousness and then feeling, yeah, but you say it's related to um to conscience. Uh it cannot mean conscience here, otherwise he would have used the word conscience. So uh uh just formally like it's to try to understand a certain

pattern also it is a little bit confusing, yeah. For for me too. Yeah.

Speaker 2: So I I had the same question here with this and and it's something that always like stands out. Why is that You know, it it should be intellect intellectual center. It should be the mind or something. The mind, you know, faith of the mind is freedom. Something in me wants to rebel again. Say, why did he why did he do that? And and another thing that occurs to me is, you know, we're talking about especially when we're talking about love and different levels of love. Well, you think of, oh Oh yeah, Gurja says there's seven levels of love. There's levels, right? Seven levels of love. There's seven levels of faith, seven levels of of of everything. Not here though. This whole Law law or whatever this is is threes. This is tripartite, and it's the only surviving marble thing of it. So it's the The main there's there's three and then he breaks it down. It's three sets of three. It just says three over and over again. Um so I I don't know why. It's consciousness on there, but something about that always just makes me go, what, hmm, um, maybe He did that on purpose to make me go stop and think twice about it.

Speaker 6: That's the one thing we can be sure of. He did it on purpose.

Speaker 4: No, probably the friction which d just arises in in some of us. I maybe it this is one of the of the purpose. Yeah, or also the last when I when I read hope of the body, I think, what does it mean? Hope, hope of the body Also I I mean when we look on the higher bodies of of men, yeah, then consciousness, feeling and body seems to are m to be more related as if we take the three centers in of the of the ordinary of the physical body. Yeah, consciousness relating to body of reason, feeling to Christian body and body to the physical body, I thought just in the moment.

Speaker 1: I think that's correct. Yeah. Mm-hmm. Th there is a terminological problem that that comes from the fact that the original teaching that Gurdjev introduced uses terminology that he'd stopped using during the tales. And if you don't actually have it clear in your mind that um that there is that distinction, then it's very easy to confuse the terminology of one, let's call it perspective, to the term from it with the terminology of another. So Very specifically, the thinking center, emotional center, and moving instinctive center are very, very strongly focused on the original in search of the miraculous description of everything. And There are many cases within this book where he uses the word mentation and he doesn't use the word thinking. And therefore he is making a distinction. Mentation is not thinking. It's absolutely not thinking. And that already creates a difficulty if you're trying to work in terms of three centers, because if mentation doesn't mean thinking, what does it mean in terms of three centers? This isn't helping, this is confusing you even more, but that is my intention.

Speaker 4: No, I find it helpful that it it opens in a in a way the perspective, yeah, not to be not to cling to the concepts which the mind can easily understand, where we realize that It cannot be everything. And so to to widen this perspective, I find it helpful, even if it if it creates a certain um ins ins uncertainty.

Speaker 7: I have another question about the versus uh of love. Um love of consciousness

evokes the same in response. Um my question is does U is this a connection to the first verse, or is it meant to be looked at um only these three um lines? Like does it mean um Love of consciousness evokes the same? Like um or is it meant uh like it's uh evokes freedom? Uh is it

Speaker 4: No. I would say it's it it's about love.

Speaker 5: It's only these three lines.

Speaker 4: Yeah.

Speaker 5: I would say too

Speaker 7: Ah because and then what would my next question would be love or feeling about the opposite? What exactly does that mean?

Speaker 1: Well and I think we need to pin down the meaning of the word of.

Speaker 6: Okay, good.

Speaker 1: Because it it actually has two possibilities. You g you can that love of something can be your love for something Right. All of us something can be love that comes strong something. So when he says love of feeling I think he's talking about love that comes from feeling.

Speaker 7: In the German uh it's also like this.

Speaker 4: Yeah, makes makes sense.

Speaker 1: Well, love that comes from feeling evokes its opposite. And this is, you can read this if you want in various um Statements made by Spensky in the fourth way is that that The various kind of emotions are always on a are always on an up-and-down curve. So if you love something one day, depending on what you mean by love, it will turn into hate. Because that's the way that the wave works. You know, we aren't very good in English language, probably similar in German, but in English language. We are not good with words for emotion. And that's because the thinking center, the the English are fundamentally thinking-centered people, but I think the Germans are too. So the the distinction is probably more in terms of English thinking versus German thinking But it it's definitely um uh uh a problem in English to ever try and talk about emotions, because talking is something the intellectual centre does. And emotions are something that the emotional center feels. And it the emotional center doesn't have any language.

Speaker 4: It's the same in German. There are attempts to do so, but when we uh really look a little bit deeper, it's it's the same, yes. For me important is the word evoke. He does not say causes the the the same or causes the opposite. So it's not a not

Speaker 5: uh like cause and effect what what we uh interpret.

Speaker 4: No, it it means uh what I read off the second line is that uh i it creates a certain uh a certain potential and because it is incomplete the other side of it is just uh called and so uh to to to to m bring it to completion. We cannot avoid that the others just enters. Not when I love someone, then he hates me. This is a little bit too uh to too much cause and

effect, but when I love just from the feeling it has no stability or no c not completeness and and so the other side somehow is evoked, not uh actually there, but it it's it it it it it might come in. Yeah, so that is what I just

Speaker 3: In the German on love evokes, is it awakens? Aweckt.

Speaker 4: Aweckt. Und bei Hervorrufen ist ja das Gleiche.

Speaker 5: Yeah, evokes the opposite, erweckt das Gegenteil. Yeah, but uh erwecken is in this sense not awaken. Okay. I mean i i you can use the same word also for awaken, but uh in this um way it it it means evokes. Yeah But i i and actually you could also say the it awakens the opposite. The opposite wakes up by in this

Speaker 4: Mm-hmm.

Speaker 5: Yeah.

Speaker 4: You could also say pro box in in a certain sense.

Speaker 3: Okay. So if you take this trial out of faith, love and hope and take it as What is consciousness? Faith of consciousness is freedom. Love of consciousness evokes the same in response. Hope of consciousness is strength. I mean that to me is enough in its own

Speaker 2: Yeah.

Speaker 4: Now I also find that also when we read the other two lines here this also gives uh a lot of indications because it points also to our weaknesses and im imbalance in in a certain way. And to know which efforts I might have to do to find to m a more balanced way to hope, to love and to have faith Yeah, I I actually learn many things uh just by seeing what not has to be done, what is not good, what others uh do uh really i uh yeah uh n negatively in a way. Yeah, because we have rarely uh ideals uh with a positive uh Role model Yeah, we have rarely barely uh positive role models, but we have uh plenty of negative role models where we can see Ah this sh I I I should never copy this or never repeat this again. It looks so stupid stupid from the outside.

Speaker 5: And yet we do it.

Speaker 6: Are are we thinking about the idea of uh self-restraint Restraining yourself at all? Would that a apply?

Speaker 3: In regards to this triad?

Speaker 6: Yeah. Well in regards particularly to what Eckant was saying. Holding away.

Speaker 4: It it might be a part of this effort, yeah. to to realize what uh what it's it's uh what I mean is it is often very easy to see and to perceive and to feel how strange other people behave. And sometimes not even so easy to see that I behave almost similarly. So in this sense, but this I learned that when I realize I have a certain um a aversion against some behavior of someone else. then I know it has something to do with me. Yeah. When when when there is a strong emotional reaction and this I learned many years before and I and this this I can work so I can realize uh yeah w what what is in me. But also another thing when I just uh when For example, when I tell when I'm in in a talk, yeah. People

usually they love, they like very much to talk Yeah, and to tell their own stories. And when I am I'm the listener, I realize after a short time uh it is almost quite boring to to listen and yeah there is not really much interest in it But when I t when I speak about my own things, yeah, I feel a certain motivation and and And then I remember, ah, maybe the other is uh similarly bored uh uh from my stories as I am. And so then I try, yeah, to you are right, Sandy, to restrain myself. not to tell too much and just a little bit and then to see is the other really interested and is there is there an exchange and yeah so in this sense.

Speaker 6: It makes sense. I don't know if you guys are ready to talk about it yet, but I'll tell you at page 364, when he starts talking and I think probably long. 363, the infirmities of old age, the salvation of the soul. Well those really appeal to me a lot since I'm uh feeling those pretty close. 363 on down to 364. The uh consequences of the maleficent disease tomorrow And how that has uh how they have grown out of of of of uh I can't put it in my own word right now, but just become a hindrance. for beings of contemporary time and totally I mean this is really sad, totally deprived of all possibilities of removing from their presences the consequences of Kundebuffer a hindrance to most of them honestly discharging at least those being obligations that are indispensable uh in the conditions of ordinary being existence. And then it goes on and um says it really I mean he just says it really uh you know in in a in a sort of like a believable and scary way that the idea of uh the forerunners of old age called feebleness and infirmity inevitable lot of all cosmic formations, great and small. And then I think the saddest thing of all is most of the consequences of the properties of the organ began the atrophy of their own accord. That's right at the bottom of uh 363. That is just uh They atrophy of their own accord and some of them us even entirely well, some of them even entirely disappear, in consequence of which These beings, we begin to see and sense reality a little bit better and seek the salvation of our soul, but it's too late. Great nature has passed us by. I mean that that really uh I mean that that that applies that really uh says a lot to me now that it didn't say ten years ago or so

Speaker 3: Yeah, me too. But it doesn't have to be us, I think.

Speaker 6: Oh, I know. It's sad for everybody though.

Speaker 3: Well, so be it. But in the German they they don't use I mean I my translation of German, it could be wrong. Feebleness and infirmity. Weakness and lack of strength. Does that sound better? Weakness and lack of strength, yes.

Speaker 5: But and basically weakness and lack of strength is the same. It's a weakness. It sounds better. Yeah.

Speaker 3: It sounds easier to overcome.

Speaker 1: Weakness applies better to other centers. Lack of strength seems to be a moving center focus, you know. That's possibly why two words are being used.

Speaker 5: And feeble feebleness and is also not a very common word, is it? I had to look it up. I I never heard it.

Speaker 1: You really never heard feebleness.

Speaker 5: No.

Speaker 4: And infirmity me too not.

Speaker 5: No.

Speaker 4: Quite un uncommon words.

Speaker 1: Oh right. That's interesting.

Speaker 5: Yes, I mean yes.

Speaker 1: Mm-hmm. Because a hospital was called an infirmary

Speaker 5: Ah, okay, yes.

Speaker 1: You know, which is it so that's like that's in let's say my English education from very young. Okay, and feeble is just one of those adjectives that um it it's not really uncommon at all

Speaker 6: That's rude to call somebody feeble, I think. So we don't use it that way, I suppose.

Speaker 3: No, we don't. Also on 364, the um Ineffectual yearnings in English. The translation I came up with in German is fruitless desire. Yeah.

Speaker 5: Yes. Very good translation.

Speaker 3: It's all about Google. That's why I have to verify through you.

Speaker 1: You shouldn't have you should have pretended it was you, Bobby. You should have said, no, I've been learning German, I know it back to front now.

Speaker 3: Well, I am going to learn German, so I won't lie about it. I I will probably use Google to learn it, but I will check back with you.

Speaker 4: Yeah, to come back to relating to this. When I read this the first time with the disease of tomorrow, I felt a certain inner resistance But very short, and then I realized okay, this exactly what is the matter with me. And it took me quite a few years to uh to encounter this somehow And now, not that I always can can do it, but it is a very clear attitude that I realize when something has to be done, I At least I have a strong wish to do it. So there is not anymore the uh the the buffer of uh self, uh what would you say Safe calm.

Speaker 5: Yeah. Self calm, yeah.

Speaker 4: Yes. So I I and and if I don't arrive to to do I feel in a way a certain kind of remorse or so. Yeah, Mania is smiling because there are many things which I am not able or have not the f the this the the the the power to to do immediately Yeah. But I I I don't feel good about so I have not the not so much anymore the attitude of uh

Speaker 5: Yeah. Well that's the self-justification or whatever.

Speaker 7: Being convinced that later they will do better and more.

Speaker 4: Yeah. This is this this this became very clear to me. And with the other about

old age Of course, I I mean we read it in in I think it's in the third book where he says uh for men is the age of sixty and for for women is the age of forty-five And when we read this the first time, Vanya was very shocked because she was already at the beginning of 40. Yeah, so I don't know if we have to take it lit literally, but it means don't actually the same, don't waste any moment. There is nothing to be wasted. Yeah, not not not not a minute and how often we, I say we, I still do it.

Speaker 5: Yes.

Speaker 4: Even if the situation the terror of the situation is actually quite clear, but it is not like Robin says, yeah, neither the consciousness is uh as uh stable as it should be, nor the conscience, so the feeling state about it Yeah, there are moments when I realize it and then I have a strong feeling about it, but after a short time it has fade faded out or softened or whatever.

Speaker 3: Think about it tomorrow.

Speaker 2: Yes. I also feel there's a real it's it's though it's pulling me back to the moment of now. you know, right now of of and and and that's the essence of like you know self-remember self-remembering or being present being here with myself can only can happen. It can only happen now. It can't happen tomorrow. It can't happen yesterday. It can only be happening right now and that that ultimately that is like all of the all of the work is just always bringing us right to now And and another thing about Morgan for tomorrow, and I don't know if this relates to the translation, if there's anything about that, but I just There's something that's to me has always been kind of really beautiful about how Morgan can mean like the morning and tomorrow at the same time. It's kind of like saying tomorrow, there's just just something beautiful about the concept of tomorrow that is a new beginning. It's a Wake it's uh waking up to a new new world, a new day, right? Whereas like tomorrow is just like really neutral and we just it's really easy. We just put a lot of negative baggage of oh tomorrow I have to do a bunch of stuff or or whatever, or tomorrow I'm gonna do this or that. Um so that sense of it is like different when I go and I hear it in the German version. It's like it it doesn't have the same Negative baggage that I have on the word, I guess.

Speaker 6: I can give you I was gonna say I can give you some. How about Shakespeare? Uh tomorrow and tomorrow and tomorrow creeps this petty pace From day to day and all our hmm lead us to dusty death. There's a little negative Morgan for you.

Speaker 4: I just remember b which we missed uh uh uh earlier that morgen in with capital letters so as a noun, we have two different kinds of morgan. We have Der Morgen, which is uh a mail article, der, like der Mann, the man. uh then it means the m the the mo the morning of the day, the the start of the day. And if you say das morgen, which means it's it's a uh Was heißt das? Neutral article in Germany means the tomorrow. So we have it's not just that we have the adverb morgen, we have also Das morgen und der Morgen. It's just came up when Paul was speaking about morgen.

Speaker 5: I had a very strong association with uh when I was reading about um that what

Sandy was mentioning in the end or in the older age that the the organ Kundebuffer is becoming less and less and people see more clearly And in my day-to-day job I have quite often to do with very old people. I mean I don't deal with them directly, I deal with the people working with them. And you have this uh phenomena of dementia quite often. So I was just thinking by reading this maybe when it comes To them that somehow it's a shock and it closes up

Speaker 3: I was just thinking about that. I don't understand. Close up or open up?

Speaker 5: Yeah, maybe the dementia is really like Okay then the that it's too hard to see it and it's closing again or I don't know.

Speaker 4: No.

Speaker 5: Because it's a very No, you have a different idea?

Speaker 4: the uh bobbin candlelnost, the concept of that if you live too lopsided, too too too unbalanced, then one of the the functioning uh ceases uh t to to to be able to work before the the others uh so this is more an explanation to I understand what you mean but I I don't think people are uh so considerate and so conscious to realize and then to come into in in this shock. I I don't think s so I I I I think more it has to do with with this Single-sided being.

Speaker 5: Okay. So is that so? Is it like this what he's describing? That it's really like this, that the consequences of the organ Kunabuff are fading

Speaker 4: Yes, I mean this is what we call the wisdom of age. Yeah, that with the age people become a little bit more flexible and a little bit more uh s smooth and uh relaxed in a way yeah but not because of inside because they have no force anymore to to be angry and engage too much yeah so

Speaker 1: My experience is that old people are actually more set generally, but certain individuals are less set. So, you know, a a person that has very strong opinions, and I've met this many times, when they get old, those opinions are even stronger.

Speaker 4: Yeah.

Speaker 1: So y you have that and then you have the situation. I think that this has got to do with the consequences of Kundabatha, because the consequences of Kundabatha are habits.

Speaker 5: Mm-hmm.

Speaker 1: You know, so there's certain, if you like, a certain energy is required to maintain something. And in some people, maybe because there is some kind of struggle. It weakens and therefore they start to see things more realistically. Some people they just don't you they they're just never gonna change their mind ever

Speaker 5: Mm-hmm.

Speaker 1: You know, they they don't have the capability of changing their mind. So it's so it's uh I'd say it's um double edged. I think he's talking about people here who actually in

one way or another um let's say had some possibilities, but it's too late, rather than people that had none.

Speaker 5: Mm-hmm. Okay, yes.

Speaker 3: You know, the Catholics bring in um a priest to deliver the last rites or extramunition. on the fact that someone's going to die. And I think that is not just for possible forgiveness of that person if they can take that, but uh Somewhat of a clarity of what their life has been.

Speaker 2: So this also makes me think of um Spensky says it a couple of times and Gurdjieff does too in different places. Um about the a acorns falling from the tree and how not all of them are gonna not all of them are gonna grow into oak trees. And um You know, I and and Spinsky, I can't remember what lecture it is where he's talking about um how um that when when people learn about this idea of consciousness and self-consciousness, oh this is great, we have to bring it to the world. But the reality is a lot of people aren't gonna aren't aren't gonna ever like be able to to grok with it, you know? Um and there's people who are um beyond for certain reasons, or they have damage for certain reasons, or they're or they're too old and that um as I, you know, coming into contact with this this teaching and these these new possibilities. I s I will struggle with the the wish to go help help people with it, help, you know, help save the world with it. Um, but that actually actually that that desire to do can just take me take me actually away from from the possibility of of of of returning to myself. So we kind of have to understand that in the great in in in great nature, there's not really any injustice that like only a small percentage of people have this uh this possibility and it's not just It's not just because of your physically how you're born. It's like what time am I born in? Am I born into a war zone? Am I born into a place where there's information? Am I born into a time like he's talking about? He talks about it, Beels of Web's Tales where, oh no, all of the, you know, Kerschlitiz here, all of the marble tablets have been destroyed by war. Now it's all gone. All you've got is just one, you know? Um it's like it's like the the odds for everyone waking up just gets worse and worse and worse as like time goes on. And so it always just it always just comes back to me. uh what possibilities do I have and and and what can I do right now to do something about it?

Speaker 4: In in this respect I find remarkable the first paragraph of three sixty three where he says that they This disease tomorrow become a hindrance in even honestly to do the being obligations of the daily life of the ordinary beings existence. Yeah, this was for me a very inter uh important uh notion when I reali when I started my I ca uh how to say my my path or so that I realized many people which I then met and there have been on the past tried to do some extraordinary things and uh to teach and to uh discover spiritual truth or whatever and I realized no I have to start with just the ordinary things so to make them more orderly more honest, more regularly, more reliable in a s in a certain sense. So this I realized I don't know, it it came very clearly to me that this is the first obligation, yeah, to have an a well-running and uh good functioning life as a basis for whatever comes then. And this again what I thought before I saw that when I observed other

peoples which didn't had these qualities. They meditated and They did beautiful things, but they won't were not able to care for their ordinary beings' existence or for the family or for the children or so.

Speaker 6: Uncle Weisaker again, to be a good steward rather than a mighty prophet, maybe.

Speaker 4: Yeah, exactly.

Speaker 5: And I find it also in this where he's saying that in the ordinary being existence you can um notice the disease tomorrow, there it also it it becomes so obvious somehow. It also was a big help for me to read this because then I could see in my day-to-day life in small things how it happens that it happens actually when I put it on the let's say on the um spiritual path it's it's always kind of foggy but in these things you you can just see if it's done or it's not or if you It's very, very practical, I find. Is it time for the exercise anyway? As we speak of the disease tomorrow.

Speaker 1: Yes, it's uh Well we could put it off till tomorrow.

Speaker 5: Like we did last week, you mean?

Speaker 4: Okay, everyone has the exercise, even Paul I sent, so you might share about your goods and bads.

Speaker 6: I'll just start by saying, you know, I really find these exercises uncomfortable, and I resist them. They must be good for me, therefore.

Speaker 5: Yeah, it's funny when we when we uh come up in this meeting, now it's exercise time, everybody goes like this, sitting straight. Saying nothing. Oh look at me.

Speaker 4: I do the same. Reading the reading the message from the last week to remember what it was.

Speaker 3: Oh yeah. Well, in respect of old age, um, this didn't have to do with last week, what had to do with um The guilt I feel sometimes because now I am older and I cannot do those things that I could do before. Now I have people here that can do those things if they Want to pay attention to what works and so on. But this guilt I have sat with thinking, what am I supposed to do? I know I am supposed to observe myself and them. And then give them space to think what what works for them, even though it may not be what works for me. And that is truly frustrating. So there's these two things, guilt and frustration. So um I sit with myself and say this is the period of life where you cannot be expected to pick up a shovel and dig in the garden every day. And that's okay. You know? So old age has its advantage if you can uh pick 'em out, I suppose.

Speaker 6: It is actually a big factor in my life right now, Bobby. My husband especially is going through it since he had his accident. and uh things that he can't do for himself. And uh what I'm finding is that uh I I I have the same thing. Some of the things I do They're difficult for me just because uh oh my knees are killing me or my feet won't work right or my hands are just not the way they used to be. So uh make the effort anyway and uh we don't have that much outside help for us so uh So it's so it's painful to look at these things.

And it it has uh emotional repercussions, if you will, that uh really try to tamp down and hide and pretend aren't there, but they are there, so uh I'm not looking at them So I guess one of my goals would be make sure I'm looking at them. And I have made that a goal, but uh it's I still tend to try to push it away.

Speaker 3: Did we lose Sandy on that? No.

Speaker 2: Frozen for me. Yes.

Speaker 6: Push the emotional reaction away. And I when I read that part today. Yeah, I'm really frozen. So that that's I guess that's what I'll report. I mean uh uh you know I pay attention and what I do is pay attention to what happens and who I encounter each day and appreciate them. And I I also have the sense that that's not enough But sometimes that's all I can do. So uh the people that come to visit or that I see in the neighborhood, uh that's uh that's that's the good things for me And coming here, I love this meeting. And by the way, a schneit playton. All day. Yeah, cool.

Speaker 4: No, your your your German is is is fine, I guess. Yes, was very clear.

Speaker 3: Good. So did you say play? I didn't what is what was Schnaake? Schneid.

Speaker 4: Schneid. It's night. It's schnight.

Speaker 3: Snowy.

Speaker 6: Yeah. All night. Oh wow.

Speaker 4: Snake.

Speaker 6: Schnight.

Speaker 4: Schnell. Schnight. Yeah, I have to say when I was thinking about the exercise myself that I'm I found to a certain uh confidence somehow I could say. When I started the work, I was very, very self-doubting and in often in self-pity and whatever and so it took me quite a lot of work to to slowly grow out of it and I often follow my I could say my conscience so that b at least what I can can can feel and hear about it. So in this sense, I feel quite often in a very good conscience and goods good about. But with this exercise I ask myself, yeah, maybe I I miss something. I was not I'm I'm not sure. I have s certainly some moments when I realize ah out of a certain laziness or hesitance, I did something which was not good, yeah, which I then feel bad about. But usually I take the next opportunity to uh to to clean it up in a way to to to bring it back or then to force myself to to do it and then to to to realize ah I have done it Yeah. But I asked myself really about this notion of remorse of conscience, yeah. Is there really nothing which I could feel remorse of? And when I asked this question to me, then I just remembered uh many things which I don't do at the moment but which I did in my life and then I felt quite strong this this process, I could say it's the easiest, the best way to describe this this process uh happening in me. And I realized it has a certain force. Yeah, it's not that I feel then down or bad. No, I realize it has a certain a certain forces, certain intensity is coming back. But I also realize it's not so easy to remind myself, to give myself time, maybe every day, a few moments to uh yeah to give space for this yeah not as a habit but to real uh to really to think about all

the things and then to give a little bit uh of Yeah, of attention to to to this process. I had one remarkable moment. I was when I was with Robin two weeks ago. We were working on the computer and I had strangely enough a moment where the computer was so insistent, wanted to drive me to some decision which I didn't want at all that I really got angry for a moment, which I rarely do with people even. But with the com I and it was a very strong impulse, very quick because I realised it immediately and then I let it go, let it pass again, but it was there. It was really strong, like and uh so and Then I I got rid of it. I d just ru balanced myself again. But then after we were driving to visit friends of of Robin And I felt this very strange uh pressure in my solar plexus. I did not understand from where it came. And then I even I try to understand and I talk to to Robin I say oh I have this this really strange uh strong pain in my in my solar plexus It might have been uh is related to this moment of deep identification I I I felt in. And just when I spoke it out, in this moment I realized yeah, this uh how how how how bad this is for me myself and I get lost in such strong I moment of identification and then I felt a deep feeling of remorse in this moment. And then after a short time it was resolved this pain in my solar plexus. So this was a very clear experience of this And I'm glad that my body tells me and that my conscience tells me and that I'm often cannot fool myself anymore. I'm very glad about it, even if it's uncomfortable

Speaker 2: Well, I can share that um I uh did have some great opportunities to experience remorse of conscience over the last week. Um I was in a Let us say series of verbal uh disag disagreements with a uh family member um over some stuff and and having experience of oh why did i say that why did i say this and i found and and and When I can become aware of it and I can take a take a pause, take a stop there when I'm experiencing this this uh the onset of remorse, then maybe I have an opportunity to do something else with it. Because if I don't, if and if I don't do anything, what happens is I find that it it just kinda takes me. Um and And and and and it turns into negativity. It just uh becomes more negativity. Um But if I can be in in front of stay in front of it. And and that's the question, how do you stay in front of it? And Um uh an an exercise like this is a is a a great opportunity to to work that and and It's honest to be honest, um, this question of remorse, remorse of conscience, um, and can I be in front of it? This is something I've I I that has been of interest to me for a while. And maybe it's something that I can kind of develop a A new new kind of muscle for, a new kind of uh reaction to, other than sp bawling in with it and wallowing in in guilt, right? That's what I it tends to turn into guilt if if it just If I just let it go. So um so yeah, that's a challenge. Stay in front of it.

Speaker 5: Yeah, I um what I f picked last week, I uh noticed that During my day-to-day work I get quite identified with what I do and I've nourish um in me the need for importance somehow But what I noticed is whenever there there in the during the last month there was something happening that there was a possibility possibility not to follow this road. of being egoistic and feeling important. But yet there was the possibility I still Did it out of habits and whatsoever. And I started to feel very bad about it. So I decided now last week when this um with uh this exercise came up that I don't wait want to waste my whole life energy in these identifications with a job and uh standing in front

of a crowd, everybody liking me, blah blah blah. And um so I I decided that whenever that happens that I'd pause for a moment and become quiet and not go my normal entertainment show which people like. And this was really working. I had a few moments where I was sitting for a few seconds in front of a group where I didn't know what to say now because if I would say what I always do, what people like. I would go the wrong track, so I just waited and did nothing. It was not long, but I used the gap and that was really helpful because in the end of the week I didn't come home totally tired and exhausted and I had energy for the family and for the kids, which was beautiful. So that um was really a nice um exercise, not nice, nice. It didn't feel nice, it felt uncomfortable and unknown and everything. But It it was like it there there's a possibility which I which I didn't experience bef so often. And this week gave me a lot of gifts in a way. That was nice. And I must say that whenever I express negativity, what you said, Paul, now I try to work on that from quite a while. Now it happens more and more often that there is something like remorse. after it happens. I actually sense it immediately that that this was not the right thing to do.

Speaker 3: I've been cared for very well for the last year and a half. while I've gone through this recovery. And at this time it's like hard to leave that You know? It's like, well, wait a minute, my dinner's always been cooked for me. It should be cooked for me still. I mean, I can see that I'm not as anxious to get up and say What can I do? Just kind of waiting and out, but that will change. Because I am feeling so much better, I have to tell you.

Speaker 5: Yeah.

Speaker 3: I mean excellently much better. That's nice. I think I can be participatory in most things now or soon. As long as I don't have other people caring for me. You have something, Robin?

Speaker 1: No, not really.

Speaker 3: You look like you had something.

Speaker 1: It's uh the the question of good and bad, you know? It it's like the the life consists to some degree, I think, once you're in the work of actually attempting to do various things. Um, you have a sort of program. Um But this this feeling of remorse, it's very rare that I experience any feeling of remorse. It's possibly because I buffer it, but you know, I couldn't think of anything. that had happened. I think then the um Life's a bit tough at the moment, so I think when life is tough, it's different. It's like you just have to get on and do things because there isn't any space. And that's kind of how I am at the moment I feel sympathy with Sandy because her husband's um ill and my wife's ill and I understand exactly what the um the pressure of that is.

Speaker 6: I've thought of you often too and Bobby too On a younger note, have we heard from Frida yet? And does she want to say anything?

Speaker 3: Are you too young to have any remorse?

Speaker 7: Oh no. No, I I actually have an example. I had forgotten the task. I read it two weeks ago and then I forgot it. But now that I remorse what it was about, uh I actually do have an example. Um Two days ago, I already told you very shortly I was taking a walk

outside on a very little road where um cars can drive there but I would say maybe once a day there is a car driving on that road so it's very um calm. And I was walking And uh suddenly a man uh a pair or a couple on bicycles came from behind me. And I didn't see them because I was walking and they came from behind. And uh I didn't hear them. Um as far as I'm concerned, they didn't use their bells or anything And uh I was walking not in the middle of the road, but not quite at the site And the woman drove by me on the left and the man tried to drove by me on the right and um touched me. So it was very, very uh close. Uh he almost ran me over with his bike and they were driving very fast. Um it must have been motorized bicycles. And I was very I was completely shocked when when it was swishing past me. And uh when I realized what happened they were already like twenty meters ahead of me because they were so fast. But I heard the woman yelling and I think him too like uh pay attention and I was so shocked, I was really completely shocked. But I also had a strong negative response to their negativity in this. And I realized it immediately, but I couldn't stop it and uh yes, that was very powerful And uh I made sure that no no not any more bicycle drivers were there and then I just lay on the str on the road and lay there for several minutes because I was so shocked Yes, and but it was very a very strong impulse, and even today when I took the same road when I um took a walk on the same road I had to think of that again and I still I still had this impulse like to think, oh what horrible people and They are the ones that should pay attention and yes, but I also realize that that's just an um an expression of negativity and uh I think it's good that at least I'm realizing it Yes, but um I'm not or I or I wasn't able to uh let it go very soon or or it was it stayed with me for quite a while.

Speaker 6: I think there's more to that than uh just negativity. I think they were definitely in the wrong. And you suffered a shock, one that would have uh If I'd had a cell phone call uh caused me to call 911 and get the police after them, uh, that they were that rude to you. So uh i that would be hard to let go. You can let go of it afterwards maybe, but uh I don't know, maybe other people have a different opinion, but there are dangerous situations like that and uh they could have done you some serious harm.

Speaker 7: Yes, and objectively that's true, but my response, my emotional response I think nonetheless is not what the word says about it because I was like, I wish he will have an accident now. So And I immediately when I thought it I thought, no, I really don't wish that, but yes.

Speaker 1: Very good.

Speaker 6: Very good. Yeah.

Speaker 1: Well I think we've run out of time. Oh well past run out of time, so let me close the meeting now. Okay. Bye everybody. Thanks for attending.

Speaker 4: Bye Rebellion.

Speaker 6: Thank you

## Notes from Chat

12:39:34 From Frieda + Ekant : The Six Descents of Beelzebub

### # Descent Context & Mission

- 1 The First Investigating the aftermath of a cosmic catastrophe. He discovers the "Organ Kundabuffer," implanted to keep humans from seeing reality. Though removed, its negative traits (ego, vanity) remained.
- 2 The Second Occurs 1,100 years later on the continent of Atlantis. Beelzebub tries to stop the practice of mass animal sacrifice, which humans used to "appease" the gods.
- 3 The Third In Ancient Egypt (the continent "Grabontzi"). He observes the rise of civilization and the "Club of the Adherents of Legominism," who tried to preserve the objective knowledge lost after Atlantis sank.
- 4 The Fourth In Babylon. He examines the "Tower of Babel" and the "learned" beings of the time, whose intellectual ego led to the "confusion of tongues" and the loss of true common sense.

12:39:44 From Frieda + Ekant : 5 The Fifth Visiting Asia to study the work of the "Messenger from Above," Ashiata Shiemash. Shiemash tried to save humanity by awakening Conscience. Beelzebub notes that after Shiemash died, his teachings were corrupted.

6 The Sixth The Modern Era (Paris, Chicago, etc.). Beelzebub is horrified by modern "civilization," its mechanization, and how humans have lost almost all capacity for "Objective Reason" or genuine being.

12:50:04 From Robin Bloor : The most common reading traces it through Armenian and Persian roots. "Ashiata" may derive from roots related to "love" or "compassion" — some connect it to the Armenian ashkhat (labor/work) or to roots meaning "he who loves." "Shiemash" is often linked to roots suggesting "mercy" or "compassion," with some scholars seeing a connection to the Semitic root racham/shiem (mercy/name) or to "Shemesh" (sun in Hebrew/Akkadian).

So the composite meaning often proposed is something like "He whose love/labor is mercy" or "The one who works through compassion" — which fits his role in the Tales perfectly, since he is the messenger who bypasses Faith, Hope, and Love (all corrupted) and works instead through Conscience, the one sacred impulse still intact in the subconscious.

12:50:14 From Robin Bloor : There's also a structural point worth noting: Gurdjieff consistently built his invented names from real linguistic roots across multiple languages simultaneously, so a single "correct" etymology is probably not the intention. The name likely carries overlapping resonances — Armenian, Persian, Hebrew, possibly Arabic — all pointing toward the same cluster of meaning around conscious labor and compassionate awakening.

His role as the "fifth" messenger (after Buddha, Moses, Jesus, Mohammed in the Tales' cosmology) who uniquely chose a non-traditional path makes the name's emphasis on work and mercy rather than doctrine or faith particularly apt.

12:52:37 From Robin Bloor : The famous triad of "faith, hope, and love" comes from Paul, not from the gospels — specifically 1 Corinthians 13:13: "And now these three remain: faith, hope, and love. But the greatest of these is love."

In the gospels themselves, Christ speaks frequently about faith (pistis) — "your faith has made you whole," "if you have faith as a grain of mustard seed," etc. He speaks extensively about love (agape) — "love your neighbor as yourself," "love your enemies," and in John, "a new commandment I give you, that you love one another." But hope (elpis) as a distinct named virtue barely appears in Christ's direct speech in the gospels at all.

12:53:15 From Robin Bloor : This is interesting in relation to Ashiata Shiemash's analysis, where he concludes that all three — faith, hope, and love — have degenerated in ordinary consciousness, with hope being the worst off. Gurdjieff seems to be deliberately engaging with the Pauline triad rather than with Christ's own teaching, and then inverting it: where Paul elevates the three as theological virtues, Ashiata Shiemash sets them aside entirely in favor of conscience, which doesn't feature prominently in Paul's framework at all.

So there's a quiet but pointed critique embedded in the Tales — that the formulation most of Christendom actually lives by (Paul's, not Christ's) is precisely the one that has become useless.

12:53:51 From Frieda + Ekant : 1. The Bible (The Foundation)

The most famous occurrence is in 1 Corinthians 13:13, written by the Apostle Paul:

"And now these three remain: faith, hope and love. But the greatest of these is love."

Context: Known as the "Hymn to Love," Paul argues that while spiritual gifts (like prophecy or speaking in tongues) are temporary, these three virtues are eternal.

Contrast with Gurdjieff: In the Bible, these are gifts from God that ennoble the soul. For Gurdjieff, they are currently "broken" in humanity and can only be restored through the awakening of Conscience.

## AI Differences between English and German

Here are the meaning differences I identified between the English and German texts:

"When all the above-mentioned was" — English uses "transubstantiated in me," implying a change of substance (a theological term suggesting inner transformation). German uses "durchdrungen war" (was permeated/pervaded), which conveys being saturated or imbued rather than undergoing a change of substance. These are quite different metaphors.

"So, my boy, when, as" — English says "my last descent in person onto the surface," where "descent" implies a downward journey to Earth. German uses "meines letzten persönlichen Aufenthaltes" (my last personal sojourn/stay), which carries no directional sense and merely denotes a period of residence.

"May the blessing of OUR" — English has "UNI-BEING CREATOR ENDLESSNESS" as three co-equal titles. German restructures this as "DER UNENDLICH EINSSEIENDE SCHÖPFER" (the endlessly one-being Creator), where "endlessly" becomes an adverb modifying "one-being Creator" rather than standing as an independent noun-title.

"And as regards that 'marble'" — English names the brotherhood "the Brotherhood-Olbogmek," treating the name as a compound title. German renders it as "Olbogmek-Brüder" (Olbogmek Brothers), which is more informal and personal in register.

"Faith, 'Love', and 'Hope'" (the marble inscriptions) — Two differences here. First, English says "Love of consciousness evokes the same in response"; German says "Liebe des Bewußtseins ruft das Gleiche hervor" (calls forth the same), omitting "in response" — so the reciprocal quality is absent in German. Second, for the feeling line, English uses "evokes" for both consciousness and feeling; German switches verbs — "hervorrufen" (call forth) for consciousness but "erwecken" (awaken) for feeling, introducing a qualitative distinction between the two processes that English does not make.

"Thanks to this abnormal hope" — English describes the disease as having "a property of evolving." German says "mit der ihr anhaftenden Eigenschaft sich weiter zu entwickeln" (with the property clinging to it of continuing to develop further). The German is more specific in two ways: "anhaftend" (clinging/adhering) characterizes how the property relates to the disease, and "weiter" (further/continuing) emphasizes ongoing progression rather than simple evolution.

"Thanks to the disease 'tomorrow,'" — English says they are convinced they will do things "better and more." German says "besser und intensiver" (better and more intensively). "More" is quantitative; "intensiver" is qualitative, referring to depth of effort rather than amount.

"Owing to the said maleficent disease" — English says beings "become aware through their Reason." German says "mit ihrer ganzen Vernunft" (with their whole/entire Reason). The addition of "ganzen" emphasizes that the totality of their reasoning faculty is involved, which English does not specify.

"there arise in them and" — English names the forerunners of old age as "feebleness" and "infirmity." German uses "Schwäche" (weakness) and "Kraftlosigkeit" (powerlessness/lack of strength). "Infirmity" in English encompasses illness and general debility, while "Kraftlosigkeit" is narrower, pointing specifically to a draining away of force or power.

"These ponderings of His then" — English says the being-impulse must be manifested "through every aspect of this consciousness." German says "von allen Seiten ihres Bewußtseins" (from all sides of their consciousness). "Aspect" suggests qualitative facets; "Seiten" (sides) is more spatial and structural, implying a surrounding or encompassing action rather than expression through different qualities.

# AI Summary

## Quick recap

The meeting focused on reading and discussing Chapter 25 of Beelzebub's Tales, specifically exploring the concepts of faith, love, and hope as presented through the marble tablet inscriptions attributed to Ashiata Shima. Participants read both English and German versions, with Vanya providing the German translation, and discussed various linguistic and conceptual differences between the two versions. The group examined the threefold divisions of faith, love, and hope across different aspects of consciousness, feeling, and body, while exploring the meaning and implications of the "disease of tomorrow" and its impact on contemporary beings. Following the reading, participants shared personal experiences related to the concepts discussed, including reflections on aging, self-remembering, and the challenge of managing remorse of conscience in daily life.

## Summary

### Bilingual Book Reading Session

The meeting began with Robin welcoming participants and introducing the unique format of reading a book in two languages. Paul McAtee introduced himself as a representative of the Gurja Foundation based in Houston, Texas, and expressed gratitude for being invited to the session. Robin noted the uniqueness of their reading approach and indicated that Bobby would be reading next.

### Ashiata Shirma's Teachings and Insights

Barbara and Vanya discussed the life and teachings of the very saintly individual Ashiata Shirma, focusing on his efforts to help three-brained beings on Earth overcome hereditary predispositions related to the properties of the Kundabuffer organ. They explained how Shirma identified hope as the most problematic of the three sacred being impulses (faith, love, and hope) and described the malevolent disease called "tomorrow" that results from postponing necessary efforts for self-improvement. The discussion highlighted Shirma's contemplation on a mountain in Iyama about how to save these beings through the manifestation of subconscious data related to conscience in their ordinary consciousness over an extended period.

### Marble Tablets and Text Analysis

The group discussed the mention of marble tablets in the text, with Robin confirming they appear on page 349. They explored connections between the tablets and Moses's commandments. Sandy raised questions about Beelzebub's descents and the timing of his investigations, particularly regarding the fifth and sixth flights. The discussion included clarifications about the German language usage, including the distinction between "Morgen" (tomorrow) and "morgen" (morning), and how capitalization is used for important terms like "God" versus regular nouns.

## **Theological Virtues Translation Discussion**

The group discussed the meaning and translation of "Ashiata Shiamash," with Paul suggesting it might be related to Zoroastrian concepts of truth and cosmic harmony. They explored the theological virtues of faith, hope, and love, with Paul noting the significance of these concepts in both biblical teachings and the chapter they were discussing. The conversation also touched on the difference between "faith" and "belief" in German, with Vanya confirming that "Glauba" can mean both faith and belief. The discussion concluded with a comparison of how these concepts are translated and expressed in different languages, particularly between German and English.

## **Terminology Clarification in Centers Discussion**

The group discussed confusion around the terminology used in describing three centers, particularly the use of "consciousness" versus "intellect" and "conscience." Robin clarified that consciousness and conscience refer to attributes of unity, where consciousness involves knowing everything all at once and conscience involves feeling everything all at once. The discussion highlighted how the original terminology from Gurdjieff's teachings differs from how terms are used in later writings, creating some confusion for readers.

## **Consciousness and Emotional Centers Discussion**

The group discussed terminology and concepts related to consciousness and emotional centers, focusing on the distinction between "mentation" and "thinking" as described in a book. Robin explained that mentation does not mean thinking, creating confusion when working with the concept of three centers. The discussion then moved to the meaning of "love of consciousness" and how it evokes the opposite response, with participants clarifying the German translation and understanding that it refers to evoking rather than causing the opposite. The conversation concluded with a discussion about positive and negative role models and the concept of self-restraint in relation to the triad of faith, love, and hope.

## **Translation Challenges in Aging Terms**

The group discussed translations and interpretations of text passages, particularly focusing on terms related to old age and infirmity. Barbara shared her translation work from English to German, with the group providing feedback on word choices like "febleness" versus "weakness" and "infirmity" versus "lack of strength." Paul reflected on the concept of "tomorrow" and its different connotations, noting how the German version seemed to carry less negative baggage than the English version. The discussion also touched on the phenomenon of dementia in elderly people, with Vanya sharing observations from her work experience.

## **Remorse and Aging Discussion**

The group discussed the concept of remorse of conscience and its relationship to aging and personal growth. Barbara shared her experience with guilt over her reduced physical capabilities in old age, while Sandy described the emotional challenges of caring for her

husband after his accident. The participants explored how to recognize and manage negative responses, with Vanya and Frieda sharing specific examples of situations where they experienced these challenges. Paul emphasized the importance of staying present with feelings of remorse rather than letting them turn into guilt, and the group discussed how external circumstances like illness and caregiving responsibilities affect their ability to practice the work's teachings.