

Meeting #4 Nov 22th

— Page 15 - 21 —

Attendees: Robin, Paula, Vanya, Ekant, Bobbie, Dirk, Michelle

Ekant: I like the story of the Kurd. What is different is in German he quietly continues to eat.

English: Even if my soul departs ... German: if I would have to abandon my soul (no departs).
Then it continues: Quietly he continued eating the red pepper ...

Bobbie: p18 “claptrap” and madcap – in German?

„Unsinn“ fabeln – fantasy. Bullshit.

Madcap: In my crazy/lunatic brain

RB: Only place where he explains difference between mentation by form and mentation by thought. Isn't directly explained in ISOM or Ouspensky. Important idea.

P15 Most favourite ideas instead of hobbies.

RB: Hobby comes from wooden horse – child's horse. Connection to horse possibly not accident – emotional part.

RB: Cutting of pages of book – familiar with?

Ekant: Not in modern times – in olden times.

Michelle: Sure he didn't mention mentation by form in other places? In German he states he will explain it in another place again.

RB: Doesn't explain mentation by form – consonance in final chapter.

Bobbie: Says many times that he will tell you later and doesn't. It was in reading the Trans-Caucasian Kurd that I am introduced to ... go to town by going to East and return by going to West ... mentation by form.

Vanya: When reading went into a different state – like reading a fairy tale to my baby girl.

Ekant: Agree.

RB: Two cents / sechs Groschen?

Ekant: 12 pfennig would be 1 Groschen then.

Bobbie: In English is what are you thinking – 2 cents worth.

RB: Two cents from bible. Woman in the temple gives last two mites. Where 2 cents comes from – New Testament – idea of woman giving all she had even though not a large amount.

Ekant: There was a specific coin worth 6 Groschen of Frederick William.

RB: Read original story which was Russian in origin ...

By the time Eliezer Reuven realized his mistake, both peasants had already gone home. The honest smith was so upset that he closed his shop, and set off on foot to refund the peasant's money. It was a hot summer's day, and the village was three miles off.

"I can't believe it!" a friend of Eliezer Reuven exclaimed. "You closed your shop and walked six miles in this heat just to return a few groshen! Why did you do that?"

"What do you expect?" Eliezer Reuven replied, "at the time of Noah's flood, people were so wicked that they would rob anyone of anything — even if it was worth less than a penny! Do you want me to be so much worse than they were, and rob a man of six whole groshen?"

Probably where it came from.

Vanya: In bible something about the lost Groschen I think. Luke 15 https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Verlorener_Groschen

Ekant: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Parable_of_the_Lost_Coin

Michelle: The term groschen is used to describe a wide variety of coins. The term comes from the Italian denaro grosso or is derived from the Latin name for the turnose.

RB: Probably a better reference than the one I found.

1 Groschen, not 6 –

RB: A lot in this text that is not visible until you dig in. He is a Kurd. Means 'mountain dweller'. Idea of mountain is out of the gospels. Sermon on the Mount – high point. Inaccuracies – apart from the two cents ... not accurate ... starts to eat the fruit by side of the road ... everything inside him starts to burn. Not what happens – insides are not affected, it is the mouth that starts to burn.

Ekant: Stomach and intestines are affected.

RB: Can make your eyes water, but it is rare.

Ekant: Remember used to eat as hot as possible and remember the whole body excited and would sweat a lot.

RB: Hotter food in England because of Indians. Phal – makes you sweat.

Eyes streaming with tears – more likely if you put fingers in your eyes.

German: Jericho-Idiot and English is Jericho jackass which is the donkey Christ rode.

Ekant: Translates to idiot.

RB: Jackass is a term that also means male donkey. G or Orage chose it.

RB: pointing with his horny finger?

Horns of wisdom reference towards the end – a wise finger.

Puts quotes around "fruit" – why?

Ekant: Fruit is usually nice tasting and this is not.

Michelle: Sweet and nice.

Ekant: Think of sweet and tasty and pepper is spice.

RB: In America peppers are fruit and some are not.

RB: What does willy-nilly mean?

Unwillkürlich – involuntarily

Without preparing or planning.

RB: Will he, nill he – whether he wills it or not – is the origin. Implies involuntariness.

Ekant: In German is a noun and 'wilkur' means arbitrarily.

RB: The fire inside – quote from G: one needs fire. Without fire, there will never be anything. This fire is suffering, intentional suffering, without which it is impossible to create anything. One must prepare, must know what will make one suffer and when it is there, make use of it.

RB: Hapless?

Unglückliche – means unhappy

Could be taken to mean unlucky, but nothing in the story that indicates he was unlucky.

Could mean under laws of fate, not chance.

Ekant: Would think in the German version just unhappy because he is eating something he didn't want to.

Michelle: Could also mean unfortunate.

RB: Accurate in terms of the book ...

RB: "Tzimus" means essence or pith and carrot stew which is also Jewish.

„Zimmes“ – is sweet

PS: Is a sweetened stew – with honey or dates and carrots, sometimes meat

Ekant: Also in Brothers Grimme

Michelle: The spelling is different in Germany, but would sound the same.

RB: Other symbol is distinction between town and country and Kurd comes from country, essence. Town is personality. Salt is biblical – ye are the salt of the Earth

Michelle: The meaning of Tzimus – not the main dish ...

RB: the word "Kurd." The word derives from the Sumerian word, karda, which means "mountain." This seems logical because the Kurds' homeland is mountainous.

Ekant: In English: In this display, he noticed one "fruit," very beautiful in both color and form, and its appearance so took his fancy and he so longed to try it

In German he decided ... to buy and taste ... and bought a pound – Pfund – still used (1/2 kilo).
... intense eagerness ... German: excited

... with a courage not customary ... German: boldness/impudence

RB: Strange idea that you would feel like that going into a shop

Bude – not really shop – like a kiosk – stall or booth

RB: Like in a marketplace.

RB: Used to worry about the word 'Transcaucasian' – area called Transcaucasia and also that Americans and Europeans are called 'Caucasians' – implies Europeans or Americans.

Ekant: Geographical region between E Europe and W Asia.

RB: True. Includes Armenia and areas of Persia and Turkey.

Horror of horrors - o Schreck – shock

RB: Etymology of horror goes back to Latin and includes idea of religious awe and veneration.

Implication of remorse from ‘burning inside’ – cheeks go red, tears from eyes.

Ekant: English: as if intent upon the fulfilment of his most important duty. In German: ... as if occupied with fulfilment of his main duty.

Says book is quite spicy and will give intense experiences – excited for me, not scared – will cut the pages.

RB: By the time this was published had been decades since pages of books were cut. I had to look it up to be sure what he was talking about. Now this is going to be a really strange idea to most people.

Bobbie: Bread – will squash the heat of the pepper and don't think he uses it at all.

RB: Bread is a religious symbol as well. Later he refers to bread as prosphora – word given to wafer in Christian ceremony. Body of Christ.

PS: In the Lord's prayer.

RB: Temptation of Christ in Wilderness – devil suggests he turns the stones into bread. And Jews in wilderness

Bobbie: Manna from heaven.

Bread could be like religion being a buffer at this point.

RB: No other mention of ‘mentation by form’ – only on p15 – also what the Guide and Index says.

One of the things G is trying to do is trying to give you associations that improve your mentation by thought – objective associations. Going to encounter various things in the use of language that we are going to have to ponder about. 150 different examples of him using ‘being’ as an adjective. I have never encountered ‘being’ used as an adjective before, so unless I ponder the meaning of that in the Tales, I don't know the meaning of what he wrote. Same with word ‘common’. Is using the word ‘common’ accurately – things we hold in common. Refers to ‘our common presence’ – accurate – have common presence, consists of different pieces. All for mentation by thought.

Ekant: Says ‘relative’ in both cases

RB: Language of the Work consists of relative meaning. Concepts that apply to psychological world – idea such as justice – is a justice number 7, 6, 5 ... levels have different meanings. Justice number 7 is justice of God himself. Justice number 6 emanates from world 6 ... Everything in language of The Work relates to spiritual evolution – single idea of the heart of the language of the Work – same whether in German, French, English. All words are related to idea of spiritual evolution and all the words that can have multiple levels – like truth, contentment – all have multiple layers and need to understand these words accordingly. Word ‘love’ in English only one word. In Greek are 7 words and have different meanings. Love of Absolute, Love of galaxy, love of Sun ... all separate ideas of Love. Unconditional Love in The Work – isn't possible. Only unconditional love is of the Absolute – everything else is conditional. At level of personality – at level of world 48 – is mostly possessiveness, identification.

Ekant: Mentation by Form more exact and has more definite content. But it depends on where your upbringing was.

RB: Nothing exact in mentation by Form. Not clear at all. Two people from different places can't understand each other.

Ekant: Mentation by thought is always relative ...

RB: When you hear a word you reflect its meaning by mentation by form – meaning you accepted at some point in your life. For most people, none of these words agree. When we talk about practical things – knife, fork, spoon, chair – not confusion about the meaning to anyone who is familiar. As soon as talk about anything to do with state – above H96 – nobody agrees on. All happens as life goes by. What thinking means, what an emotion is. Ask two people to explain emotion of boredom – 2 different explanations. If we both experience something beautiful, the emotions we have will be different – because of mentation by form – so beautiful in different ways. He is trying to give you associations that help with that.

In Ouspensky or Maurice Nicoll “Formatory Thinking” that is what mentation by Form is.

RB: G and Ouspensky/Nicoll describe formatory apparatus in different ways – don't agree.

AI Summary for Meeting #4

Quick recap

The team discussed the concept of human Mentation, distinguishing between Mentation by Thought and Mentation by Form, and its relation to geographical location, climate, and environment. They also explored the origins of various stories and phrases, including the Jewish story of an honest blacksmith, the biblical parable of the lost coin, and the meaning of the word "willy-nilly". Lastly, they delved into the translation of a text from German to English, focusing on the cultural and geographical contexts of the phrases used.

Next steps

Robin to provide more information on mentation by form and mentation by thought in future meetings.

All participants to research and reflect on the concept of "mentation by form" before the next meeting.

Ekant to share his findings on the etymology and meanings of "Zimmes" in different contexts.

Robin to share the story of "The Honest Blacksmith" in the chat for reference.

All participants to read Luke 15 in the Bible for context on the lost coin parable.

Robin to provide more examples of Gurdjieff's use of language, particularly the use of "being" as an adjective.

All participants to reflect on the concept of relative meanings in the "language of the work" as explained by Robin.

Robin to share more information from "In Search of the Miraculous" regarding the language of the work.

All participants to consider the different levels of meaning for concepts like justice and love as discussed in the meeting.

Robin to provide more clarity on the differences between Gurdjieff's and Ouspensky's descriptions of the formatory apparatus.

All participants to prepare questions about mentation by form and thought for discussion in the next meeting.

Robin to share more examples of how Gurdjieff uses symbolism and metaphors in the text for the next meeting.

All participants to read the next section of the text for discussion in the following meeting.

Summary

Transcaucasian Kurd's Fruit Conundrum Discussed

Vanya discussed a story about a Transcaucasian Kurd who, despite having little money, decided to buy a fruit he found appealing. The fruit turned out to be red pepper, which he continued to eat despite feeling unwell. A fellow villager, known for his wisdom, found the Kurd's actions puzzling and questioned him about his decision to eat the pepper. The Kurd insisted on eating it, having already paid for it. Vanya used this story to illustrate a human inconsistency, where people feel compelled to use something they've paid for, even if it's detrimental to their health. Ekant and Robin discussed the differences in the English and German versions of the story,

noting the emphasis on the Kurd's calm and quiet eating in the German version.

German Translations and Mentation Discussion

The group discusses the German translations of certain English terms related to thoughts and ideas. Ekant provides the German equivalents for "claptrap" and "madcap" from the text. Michelle mentions she needs to excuse herself early to put her child to bed. Robin highlights the importance of the section explaining the difference between mentation by form and mentation by thought, which is not clearly explained elsewhere. Vanya notes the German translation starts with "Lieblingsideen" meaning "favorite ideas."

Exploring "Hobby," "Mentation," and "Coins"

The meeting revolved around the discussion of various topics, including the origin of the word "hobby" and its connection to a wooden horse toy. The participants also discussed the concept of "mentation by form" and its relation to the emotional impact of a story. The conversation also touched upon the significance of the number 6 in relation to coins and their value in different time periods. The participants also shared their personal experiences and interpretations of the story, with some mentioning the impact of the story on their emotional state. The conversation ended with a discussion about the origin of the phrase "two cents" and its connection to the Bible.

Origins and Inaccuracies of Jewish Story

Robin discussed the origins of a Jewish story about an honest blacksmith, Eliezer Reuven, who accidentally mixed up the amounts owed by two peasants. The story was originally Russian and was about a blacksmith who was so upset by his mistake that he closed his shop and walked 6 miles to refund the peasants' money. Vanya and Ekant added that the story is also found in the Bible, specifically in Luke 15, as the parable of the lost coin. The group also discussed the inaccuracies in the story, such as the Kurd's dwelling at a high point and the blacksmith spending 2 cents or 6 Groshun.

Hot Peppers, Language, and Perception

Robin, Ekant, and the team discussed the effects of eating hot peppers, specifically capiscum. They noted that the heat from the peppers doesn't affect the insides of the body, and it's not common for eyes to water when eating hot peppers. They also discussed the translation of "jackass" to "idiot" in the German text, and the potential metaphorical meaning of this. The team also touched on the concept of "horny finger" and its possible meaning in the context of the story. Lastly, they discussed the difference in perception of fruits in Germany and America, and the origin of peppers from Mexico.

Exploring "Willy-Nilly" and "Hapless" Meanings

The team discussed the meaning of the word "willy-nilly" and its German equivalents, concluding that it doesn't necessarily imply planning but does involve a certain level of spontaneity. They also explored the concept of "hapless" and its implications in the context of the story of the Kurd. The team agreed that "hapless" could mean someone who is not directly influenced by the laws of chance but instead by the laws of fate. They also touched on the etymology of the word "hap" and its evolution in meaning from positive to negative.

Exploring the Meaning of "Zimmers"

The team discussed the meaning and origin of the word "Zimmes" or "Tzimus" in various languages, including German, English, and Yiddish. They explored its usage in different contexts, such as a type of stew, a term from the Brothers Grimm, and a reference to the distinction

between town and country people. The team also touched upon the biblical reference to salt and its significance in the context of the discussion. The conversation ended with Michelle sharing a page she found about the meaning of Tzimus and its terminology.

Translation and Cultural Context Discussion

Ekant, Robin, Vanya, and Michelle discussed the translation of a text from German to English. They focused on the phrases "Toky's fancy", "pound", "half a kilo", "intense eagerness", "courage not custom to him", "boldness", "impudence", "bude", "kiosk", "marketplace", "Transcaucasia", "horror of horrors", and "schreck". They clarified the meanings of these phrases and discussed their cultural and geographical contexts. The conversation was lively and involved a lot of back-and-forth, with everyone contributing to the discussion.

Religious Symbolism and Book Discussion

Robin discussed the story of a religious figure who experienced remorse and dread, which was related to the idea of burning inside. The group also discussed the potential difficulty of the book they were reading, with Ekant expressing his intention to persevere. Barbara shared her knowledge about bread being used to alleviate the heat of peppers, and the group discussed the religious symbolism of bread. Robin also mentioned the absence of any other mention of mentation by form in the book, which was only found on page 15.

Mentation by Thought vs Form Explained

Robin discussed the concept of "mentation by thought" and "mentation by form" in the context of the work. He explained that mentation by form is subjective and depends on one's upbringing and geographical location, leading to different interpretations of words and ideas. In contrast, mentation by thought is more objective and aims to provide associations that enrich existing associations. Robin also highlighted the importance of understanding the language of the work, which is centered around the idea of spiritual evolution. He used the example of the word "love" to illustrate how different levels of love exist in the work, each with its own meaning. Ekant expressed confusion about the distinction between mentation by thought and mentation by form, which Robin clarified. The conversation ended with Robin acknowledging the complexity of the topic and the need to continue the discussion in future sessions.

