

Meeting #2 Nov 13th

— Page 4 to 9—

Paula's Notes

Attendees: Robin, Paula, Sandy, Vanya, Bobbie, Ekant, D Avery, Robert D, James, Michelle F

Sandy: Something called functional shift. Uncommon use of words. ... psychological research from MRIs ... appear in low side of brain known to shift attention. G does this – putting words in unusual places and gets our attention neurologically and not only linguistically.

RB: He will have known that and it is likely to be important. Will research it.

BP: A lot of capitalisations in the German version.

RB: Because they are nouns.

Sandy: Are the neologisms difficult in German? All the things Robin talked about ... as difficult in German?

MF: No easier in German. Length of sentences also as difficult in English.

Sandy: Intentional inexactitudes – as heavy-handed in German?

Rb: Have to take by example.

James: Surprised by the exactitude of the translation.

MF: You will find some differences. French less exact.

The waking consciousness is put in quotes in German not in English. P8 (top).

James: Narenpossen – monkey business. An idiot?

MF: Someone who could say anything to the king without being beheaded.

RB: A fool!

MF: Quote marks in German – mean doesn't mean what it appears to.

Ekant: Can also be a kind of name, or ironically.

RB: So pay special attention to something quoted on one side and not another.

Ekant: A lot of examples.

Hauptnachdruck

Ekant: nachdruck – means to give a word a certain intensity. Hauptnachdruck – not usually used in German.

Druck means pressure.

MF: Nach means additive.

Ekant: Could be second print – druck means print also. But in this sense would be pressure. Haupt ... most important.

MF: It is over-emphasis.

Ekant: He gives a lot of pressure to other sayings and this is the greatest.

RB: Bon ton is an English expression borrowed from French. Doesn't have an English version. We would think well-mannered. He wasn't happy with other words for this.

PS: I have always thought it was because it can be translated as 'good tone'

MF: Written so don't step on toes of others. My boss was a master of using a lot of words without saying anything.

MF: Not hysterical ladies.

RB: Irony in that. Question as to what he means. Hysterical comes from the word 'womb' – all women have a womb, so a statement of truth.

Ekant: Freud uses hysteria to describe behaviour of women.

RB: 1610 – nervous disease of women ... because men don't get hysterical.

In English also came to mean extremely funny. Hysterical jokes make you laugh.

MF: Not in German.

Ekant: Hysteria is someone who loses control and is almost psychotic. A very sick behaviour – like a disease.

RB: Honeyed and inflated phrases. Not in German – only inflated.

MF: Maybe it was added to the English only later on.

Ekant: Can't use honeyed in German – would have to use more words. Sugared – yes.

RB: Beginning with a Warning ... (p5) – just not true! Going to have the impact almost immediately of destroying all self-calming behaviour – it doesn't do that. He would know it wouldn't do that.

MF: It did for me.

RB: Not immediately.

MF: For some people have big impact in short time and others over a longer period.

PS: I think there is some irony in that paragraph.

RB: Irony is a statement in contradiction – made in a way that you realise there is a contradiction. Someone drops a cup on the floor and you say "that was clever" ...

RB: And nothing stuck ... p8

Ekant: Sounds very ironic. Make joke about astrologists determine who you are.

James: Goat = Capricorn?

RB: Crazy lame goat is Capricorn. Doesn't have 2 back legs – has fishtail.

MF: Born in the sign of Capricorn.

RB: Broken window is movement from one year to the next and he was born at that time according to Orthodox calendar. Sound of Edison Phonograph – couldn't have been one – was invented one month before his birth.

PS: Depends what year he was born.

RB: We know what year he was born. We managed to find out who Dean Borsh was and G

couldn't have been in the choir unless he was born in 1877. Midwife – war going on between Turkey and Russians and Russians were winning and Turks fighting with German weapons and should have been winning, but Russians won. German weaponry – wasn't Ersatz – didn't get proper enjoyment – Turkey didn't get proper enjoyment.

In MWRM reference to what is God doing now? Battle at Sari Kamish – mentioned in conversation between G's father and Dean Borsh and determined end of that part of that war.

Sandy: Really good interpretation – Midwife as war between Russians and Turks and genuine German weaponry ... does that come across in the German version too?

James: Ersatz is an important word.

MF: You will not find the connection with the German/Russian war ...

Ekant: What Robin says makes a lot of sense.

Sandy: ... "drangen" makes me think of the sound of war.

Ekant: German ersatz – take something as a substitute of something – such as ersatz coffee.

James: Were there things such as ersatz cocaine lozenges?

Has shape of bullet.

RB: Originally used to describe units of army reserve regarded as lousy soldiers – replacement or substitute soldiers. The meaning is military.

RP: Cocaine being product of opium – connection with war – makes stronger. Used for pain control.

RB: Used in WW1 as local anaesthetic and for treating morphine addiction.

RP: Invalid – uses Krankheit ... disease of saying too much. In MWRM made statues of Invalid in Bed for holding money.

MF: Ersatz. German etymology is different. Ersatz m. 'that which serves as renewal, substitution or restoration' (18th century), older 'punishment' (15th century).

Ekant: Also says first a person or something which can be used instead of something else. Or a reserve in battle who can join if needed.

Vanya: Have ersatz man in sport.

James: Substitute.

RB: If the meaning is different from one language to another. Interesting to me that 'honeyed' doesn't exist in German. I want to read the German version and going to spend a lot of time with these words to try and understand the nuances of the language. G will have used Louise March's knowledge of the German language. There was no creation of MWRM or Life is Real in German – only The Tales. Whether we could create a better translation of MWRM after we have been through this.

Vanya: The title doesn't include All and Everything in German.

RB: He does list the three books.

MF: ALL UND ALLES is on the first cover. And then BEELZEBUBS ERZÄHLUNGEN FÜR SEINEN ENKEL EINE OBJEKTIV UNPARTEIISCHE KRITIK DES LEBENS DES MENSCHEN

RB: Different typography in English.

Ekant: Maybe an editor made changes to later editions. We have to be careful

RB: PLAN DES GESAMTWERKES IN 3 BÄNDEN

I. Serie in 3 Büchern „EINE OBJEKTIV-UNPARTEIISCHE KRITIK DES LEBENS DES MENSCHEN" oder „BEELZEBUBS ERZÄHLUNGEN FÜR SEINEN ENKEL"

II. Serie in 3 Büchern „BEGEGNUNGEN MIT BEMERKENSWERTEN MENSCHEN"

III. Serie in 4 Büchern »DAS LEBEN IST NUR DANN WIRKLICH,, WENN ICH BIN"

MF: It was the 1951 edition and I have 1981 edition.

Vanya: Interesting that ALL UND ALLES is lost. German word All is also Universe.

MF: I think he meant this – Russian version is same.

RB: Think these meetings will have to be 2 hours at this stage.

AI Summary

Quick recap

Robin and Sandy discussed two YouTube links and Robin presented basic information and ideas necessary for understanding The Tales. (The YouTube links were in the notes of the last meeting and are reeated here: Toulosites - Cathars They sang chants and hymns as they walked into the fire. https://youtu.be/HlGO9lRJeeg?si=9j3iPTK_9EryMkCy This is the Aeioiua Sandra mentioned in regard to the Toulosites. <https://youtu.be/QLDjlMcqFpw?si=wW-R7lbB3TFY93C> Then this one tells the Toulosite story directly.

The use of language in Gurdjieff's tales, including the use of noun adjuncts, intentional inexactitude, and the importance of understanding the context of names and references were discussed. The team also discussed the translation of certain phrases, the concept of irony, and the interpretation of an allegorical passage from Gurdjieff's writings.

Next steps

- Robin to provide more information on the etymology and philological aspects of key words in the Tales.
- Vanya to continue reading German passages from the Tales in future meetings.
- Michelle to share insights on German language nuances and translations in the Tales.
- Sandy to compile notes on the allegorical interpretations of passages, particularly the mid-wife reference.
- James to research more on the historical context of Gurdjieff's birth, including the Turkish-Russian War.
- Ekant to analyze the use of quotation marks and capitalization in the German version compared to the English version.
- Barbara to compare specific paragraphs between the German and English versions in future discussions.
- Paula to investigate different accounts of Gurdjieff's birth year and its significance in the Tales.
- Robert to provide more information on Dean Borsch and his connection to Gurdjieff's early life.
- All participants to continue studying the intentional inexactitudes and hidden meanings in the Tales.

Summary

YouTube Links and Project Presentation

Robin and Sandy discussed two YouTube links Sandy had sent, with Robin confirming receipt and Sandy expressing curiosity about their content. Robin then began a presentation about basic information and ideas necessary for their current project, which she had been preparing for the past three years. She also mentioned a minute of silence for everyone to collect themselves.

Understanding Tales and Typography

Robin discussed the importance of understanding the nature of tales, philology, and the use of

English and German typography in studying the titles. She emphasized the need to draw attention to neologisms, names invented by Gurdjieff, and intentional inexactitudes in the text. Robin also highlighted the importance of researching Gurdjieff, himself, the context of his references, and the geographical landscape of some events. She pointed out that some parts of the text require diagrammatic understanding. Robin also discussed the meaning of certain words, such as "on" and "impromptu," and the importance of considering etymology when reading the tales. She noted that the book's typographical standards make it impossible to translate simply due to differences between English and German typography.

Noun Adjuncts and Typographical Styles

Robin discussed the unique use of noun adjuncts in English, specifically the term 'being', and how it is used in Gurdjieff's tales. He explained that the use of quotes around certain words in the tales indicates irony, non-standard meaning, or disapproval. Robin also discussed the typographical style adopted for the English publication of the Bible, where the words of God were always capitalized, and how this style is used in the tales. He further explained the use of full capitalization for the name of the Absolute and the invention of new words in the tales, often with morphemes from various languages. Lastly, he touched on the use of names for characters, both historic and invented, and the need to understand the context to determine their meaning.

Gurdjieff's Writing Techniques and Functional Shifts

Robin discussed the intentional inexactitude used by Gurdjieff, in his writing to provoke readers' attention and encourage discovery. Sandy introduced the concept of functional shifts in language, which Gurdjieff, frequently employs to capture attention neurologically. Barbara then began reading from her book, addressing the reader with a warning about her lack of experience in writing and her intention to write without adhering to conventional rules or the bonton literary language. She also touched on the prevalence of a new disease causing people to write articles or books, and expressed hope that the reader would have acquired immunity to it.

Gurdjieff's Unusual Birth and Writing

Gurdjieff expresses his lack of knowledge of literary language and writing conventions, despite being taught them as a child. He attributes this to an unusual event at his birth involving sounds from a phonograph and the midwife sucking a cocaine lozenge. As a result, Gurdjieff says he will write in simple, everyday language without literary manipulations or grammatical intricacies. He is unsure which language to write in, but states he will write prolifically as is his nature.

Language Differences and Translation Discussion

The team discussed the beauty of language and the differences between the German and English versions of a tale. They noted the use of capitalization in the German version, particularly for nouns, and discussed the translation of certain phrases. The team also discussed the importance of studying different languages to understand their similarities and differences. They decided to further explore the translation of specific words and phrases, with a focus on page 8 of the German version.

Translation and Phrase Placement Discussion

The team discussed the translation of certain phrases from English to German. They focused on the phrase "monkey business" and its possible meanings in German, with some members suggesting it could refer to deceptive behavior or foolish antics. They also discussed the phrase "hauptnachdruck," which was created by combining German words and does not have a typical meaning in German. The team also encountered some confusion regarding the placement of certain phrases in the text, with some members initially placing them on page 6 instead of page

7.

Word Usage, Irony, and Influence

The team discussed the use of certain words and phrases, with a focus on the word "normally" and its usage. They also discussed the potential impact of a book on its readers, with some members questioning whether it would have any effect on those who don't read it. The concept of irony was also explored, with examples given to illustrate its meaning. The conversation ended with a discussion about the potential influence of a certain event on a person's life, using a story involving a midwife and a lozenge as an example.

Gurdjieff's Allegory and German Weaponry

In the meeting, the group discusses an allegorical passage from Gurdjieff's writings. Robin provides an interpretation that the "midwife" refers to the German weaponry supplied to Turkey during the Russo-Turkish War, which did not lead to the expected Turkish victory. The group explores the meaning of the German word "ersatz" (substitute) in this context. Sandy appreciates hearing the passage read aloud in German, finding the sounds evocative of war. The discussion touches on Gurdjieff's birth year and his intentional obfuscation of details about his life.

Other Notes

The crazy lame Goat is Capricorn. The Midwife may well be an allegorical reference to Turkey which at Gurdjieff's birth was at war with Russia. Turkey had brand new German weaponry but the Russians were victorious on the battlefield. Gurdjieff was born at the turn of the year - the year in which the Edison phonograph was invented.

